Assessing the Effectivenessof the Integrated Quality Management System (Iqms) At A Training College in Kwazulu-Natal

Thamsanqa Emmanue[1] Nxumalo[1], Martha Harunavamwe[2],

[1]*Department Of Business Studies, Management College Of Southern Africa (MANCOSA)*
[2]*Department Of Business Studies, Management College Of Southern Africa (MANCOSA)*

ABSTRACT: *The empirical analysis generally showed that the implementation of the Integrated Quality Management System is not effective at the College as management needs to ensure that performance management is conducted properly for improved results. The study suggests that the College should ensure that employee's day-to-day activities are aligned to the organisation's objectives. In addition, the staff development programmes should be informed by the output from performance evaluation to address barriers which hinder effective curriculum delivery. This study explored the understandings, views and experience of the academics of the College in the implementation of the Integrated Quality Management System. The general observation is that the system is not effectively implemented at the College. Continuous poor work at the College shows that performance management is not effectively implemented. The study was conducted using a questionnaire to gather data that was then analysed to produce findings through given objectives. The findings were then used to come up with strategies for effective implementation for academic growth that will hopefully improve the throughput and certification rates. The empirical analysis generally showed that the implementation of the Integrated Quality Management System is not effective at the College as management needs to ensure that performance management is conducted properly for improved results.*

Keywords: *quality management; performance management; staff development*

I.   INTRODUCTION

Two of the seven considerations of the study conducted by the Technical and Vocational Education and Training College's Technical Task Team (HRDCSA 2014:26,30) are the continuous development of lecturers and the implementation of a performance management regime. The general recognition is that most TVET colleges are not performing well in both student and institutional output (DHET 2012). Colleges are currently using the Integrated Quality Management System policy (Education Labour Relations Council, 2003) to establish capabilities, measure effectiveness and areas for capacitation, and to support for continued growth of the academic staff (IQMS for Public FET College Based Educators, 2005:4). The general observation is that the system is not effectively implemented at the TVET College. The study is aimed at assessing the effectiveness of the Integrated Quality Management System and come up with strategies for effective implementation for academic growth that will improve the throughput and the certification rate.

1.1 Research Context: Background

South Africa is currently facing a high rate of unemployment, inequality and poverty (HRDCSA 2014:16). According to McGrath and Lugg (2012:627) the strengthening of the South African TVET system will provide access to high quality technical vocational education for all without losing TVET's relationship with the world-of-work. One of the priorities in the National Development Plan Vision for 2030 (2011:261) is the improvement in education and training. The White Paper for Post-School Education and Training (2013:16) also emphasises improved teaching and learning. To achieve high throughput and the certificate rate, colleges need to constantly evaluate and develop the employed lecturers. The College offers National Certificate Vocational Programmes and the National "N" Diploma

Programme in both Natural and Business Studies in five main locations in KwaZulu-Natal. Employee performance for academic staff in the organisation is measured through the Integrated Quality Management Systems (IQMS). Assessing the effectiveness of the IQMS emanates from poor work output observed from some of the college employees which impacts negatively on the overall performance of the College.

1.2 The Research Problem

According to Pillay (2010:8), a study conducted at Sedibeng TVET College showed that lecturers are disgruntled with the implementation of IQMS as they were not part of the dialogue in development of the system. The other concerns raised was the appointment of friends by the lecturers for the Development Support Group with a view of inflating scores for grade and pay progression, the disruption of teaching and learning during evaluation processes, the college training programmes that are not responsive to the development needs of the lecturers, and that the process that did not produce the desired purpose.The above evidence gives a clear picture of the ineffectiveness of the administration of the Integrated Quality Management System in the College where the study was conducted. The continuous poor work output in terms of the throughput rate and the certification rate at the College prompted this research study in order to establish the cause. The design of the Skills Questionnaire used at the College is not in line with the Integrated Quality Management System (UMF-kills Questionnaire: R012-November 2014). The study will therefore assess the effectiveness of the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS) and provide recommendations on how best to effectively implement the system within the institution.

1.3 Research Questions

- How effective is the implementation of the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS) at the College?
- Do academic staff members comply with the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS)?
- What are the barriers towards compliance with the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS)?
- What are the strategies that can be recommended for improving the staffs' experience of the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS)?

1.4 Significance of the Study

The White Paper for Post-School Education and Training (2013:17) also emphasizes the need for the evaluation of college lecturers to ensure the identification of the development needs and development of relevant programmes to improve qualification and capabilities. The study will also be beneficial to all Technical and Vocational Education and Training Institutions in terms of aligning employee development to performance management. The research findings and recommendations will help develop effective strategies of implementing the Integrated Quality Management System for continued growth of the academic staff for improved quality of education. The effective implementation of the IQMS will result in the ongoing development of the staff to meet the required standards and improve competency. The body of knowledge acquired in this study may be beneficial to public and private colleges and also assist in providing knowledge for future studies.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

According to IQMS policy (ELRC, 2003:1), an Integrated Quality Management System is defined as a management system that encourages the evolution of integrated, motivated and learning human activities in seeking continuous improvement and economic usage of selected and focused structures, integrated systems, technology, processes and resources required for the creation of transformation and service delivery in education. According Government Gazette (Volume 433, No. 22512:7), the areas of evaluation are;

- Basic Functionality
- Leadership, management and Communication
- Governance and Relationships
- Quality of Teaching and Learning, and educator development
- Curriculum provision and resources
- Learner achievement
- School safety, security and discipline and parents involvement.

2.1 Performance Management

Noe,Hollenbeck, Gerthart and Wright (2012:341), defines performance measurement as "the process through which managers ensure that employees' activities and outputs are congruent with the organisation's goals". Grobler, Wärnich, Carrell, Elbert and Hatfield (2006:264) defines performance management as "a process of creating a work environment or setting in which people are enabled to perform to the best of their abilities for the achievement of shared goals".

The Purpose of Performance Management: According to Noe *et al.*, (2012:344), "a performance management system serves to link employee to overall organisational strategy and organisational objectives". Grobler *et al.*, (2006:264) claims that performance management system helps the organisations with administrative decisions on salary, layoffs and promotions as it provide data about employee effectiveness and drawbacks that need development.

Approaches to Performance Management: Kleynhans,Markham, Meyer, Van Aswegen and Pilbeam (2007: 141 -170), describes the approaches as the different ways of effectively evaluating performance in an organisation. In order to achieve the business strategic goals, organisations can select a single approach or combine many approaches for implementing effective performance management system(Snell and Bohlander, 2007:343).

Comparative Approach: According to Snell and Bohlander (2007:342) "the comparative approach compares individuals' performance with the performance of others in three techniques, ranking from best performer to worst performer, forced distribution where employees are ranked in groups, and paired comparison where they are evaluated in work groups". According to Noe *et al.*, (2012:350) comparative approach are classified into the following three categories;

1. Ranking method where managers rank employees in their department from highest performer to poorest performer,
2. Forced distribution where employees are ranked in groups, and
3. Paired comparison: Managers compare every employee with every other employee in the work group, giving a score of 1 every time he or she is considered the highest performer

In an educational institution, the comparative method cannot be used due to "the common failure to be linked to the strategic goals of the organisation" (Nel, Werner, Haasbroek, Poisat, Sono and Schultz (2011:409).

The Attribute Approach: According to Noe et al, (2012: 354), the attribute approach is aimed at identifying the employee attributes needed for the organisations' success. The workers are rated in an illustrated rating scale used by the managers to evaluate certain qualities and characteristics, and combined standard scale where subordinates are rated against appropriate performance dimensions (Nel et al, 2011: 416). The two types of attribute approach are the graphic rating scale and the mixed standard scale. According to the description from the IQMS Manual (2003:28 – 30), performance standard 5 dealing with participation on activities for growth and 11 for evaluating any employee contribution to the college are evaluated using the attribute approach.

The Behavioural Approach: According to Noe et al, (2012: 359) "the behavioural approach defines behaviours necessary for effective performance in a particular job where managers are able to identify the extent to which a subordinate has exhibited the required behaviours". Nel *et al.*, (2011:416) further declares that "the behavioural-based techniques include critical incidents, behaviourally anchored rating scale, behavioural observation scale, organisational behaviour modification and assessment centres". The behavioural approach is used in the Integrated Quality Management System to lecturers in performance standard 6, 12 and 16 respectively (IQMS Manual 2003: 28 -30).

The Results Approach: Noe *et al.*, (2012:361) explains the results approach as, "the based on the premise that results are the one best indicator of how a subordinate's performance has contributed to organisational success". Noe *et al.*, (2012:363), further declares that, "the result-based techniques include, management by objectives, productivity measurement and evaluation (ProMES), and balanced scorecard".

Management by Objectives: According to Brown (2011: 344–345), "two reasons can be distinguished; one is to clarify the organisation's goal and plans at all levels; the other is to gain better motivation and participation from the organisation's members". The participation by all members of the organisation in goal setting enables managers to control and monitor individual performance against the set goals and objectives (Brown 2011:344).

Productivity Measurement and Evaluation: According to Noe *et al.*, (2012:363), "Productivity Management and Evaluation Systems involve a process of motivating employees to higher productivity".

The Balanced Scorecard: According to Snell and Bohlander (2007:358) "balanced Scorecards may be used to manage the performance of individual employees, teams, business units as well as the organisation itself. The appraisal focus is on finance, customer, processes and learning".

Quality Approach: Kleynhans et al, (2007: 141 -170), declares that, "the quality-based performance system design should focus on the assessment of the employee and system factors, the relationship between managers and employees in solving performance problems, internal and external customers in setting standards and measuring performance, and using several a number of sources to evaluate employee and system factors". The quality approach is aimed at improving customer satisfaction (Noe *et al.*, 2012:365).

The Multi-Rater Approach: According to Snell and Bohlander (2007:343) the performance of the employee is evaluated by the direct supervisor and the people whom the employee interact with on daily basis. Evaluation may be done by customers, subordinates, colleagues, suppliers, and consultants. Snell and Bohlander (2007:343) further explain that the multi-rater approach enables employees to gather precise view of their performance as "different people see different things". The wide range of performance standards from 1 to 17 are designed in a manner that they are evaluating using the attribute approach as lecturers need to positively contribute to the improvement or growth of the college, the behavioural approach which focus on the interactions with stakeholders, the results approach in terms of performance standard 4, 7, and 10, as well as the quality approach to evaluate the output which in this study is students' results.

2.2 Benefits of Performance Management

According to Snell and Bohlander (2007:343), "managing employee or system performance facilitates the effective delivery of strategic and organisational goals". Benefits for performance management may include firstly, direct financial gains as operational costs are reduced, secondly, motivated workforce where employee engagement in an organisation is improved through professional development programmes, and thirdly, management control becomes flexible and responsive to the company needs. According to Kleynhans *et al.*, (2007: 141-170), "an effective performance process allows managers to evaluate and measure the individual performance and optimise productivity by; aligning individual employee's day-to-day actions with strategic business objectives, providing visibility and clarifying accountability related to performance expectations, documenting individual performance to support compensation and career planning decisions, establishing focus for skills development learning activity choices, and creating documents for legal purposes to support decisions and reduce disputes". According to Nel *et al.*, (2011:409), performance management planning involves, "setting the direction and defining the expectations, determining the employee goals and objectives"

2.3 Total Quality Management

Total Quality Management (TQM) was first advocated by Dr W. Edwards Deming in the late 1950's with an aim of improving service delivery in the US industry. In the same year, 1950, Arnold Feigenbaum, doctoral students at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology defined Total Quality Management as "an effective system for integrating the quality development, quality maintenance and quality improvement efforts of the various groups in an organisation so as to enable production and service at the most economical levels which allow for full customer satisfaction". The vision for the College is, "to pursue high-quality, flexible and market-responsive programmes to assist the economic transformation of South Africa". The College needs to implement Total Quality Management to sanction accountability, to oversee the overall organisation's performance and to assess the educators' performance through the Integrated Quality Management System.

2.4 Total Quality Management Concepts

According to Heizer and Render (2014:227-231), the concepts for Total Quality Management are, "continuous improvement, six sigma, employee empowerment, benchmarking, Just-in-Time (JIT), and knowledge of tools in implementing a TQM programme". In relation to this study, we will unpack the following four:

Continuous Improvement: According to Heizer and Render (2014:248), Total Quality Management commands an ongoing continuous improvement embracing stakeholders, resources, and procedures. Walter Shewhart established a circular model which he named, PDCA (plan, do, check, and act), as his version of continuous improvements. According to Heizer and Render (2012:248), "the PDCA cycle is a system series of steps for gaining valuable learning and knowledge for continual improvement of a process". In his cycle, "Plan step involves, identifying a goal or purpose, formulate a theory, determining success metrics and putting a plan to action. The Do step is the implementation of the components of the plan, the Study step is where outcomes are monitored to test the validity of the plan for signs of progress and success, or problems and areas of improvement. The Act step closes the cycle,

integrating the learning generated by the entire process, change methods and sometimes reformulate a new theory".

Six Sigma: The six sigma is a programme intended to address poor quality to help reduce cost, save time, improve quality and improve customer satisfaction. The programme focuses on defining, measuring, analysing, improve, control and customer satisfaction.Schroeder (2008: 538) define the six sigma as, "a comprehensive system for achieving and sustaining business success. It is a strategy because it focuses on total customer satisfaction. It is a discipline because it follows the formal Six Sigma Improvement Model known as DMAIC, and a set of seven tools which are check sheet, scatter diagrams, cause-and-effect diagrams, Pareto charts, flowcharts, histograms, and statistical process control. Heizer and Render (2014:249) further claims that the six sigma tasks have five steps or phases distinguished as;

1. Define the project's purpose, scope, and outputs and then identify the required process information, keeping in mind the customer's definition of quality.
2. Measure the process and collect data.
3. Analyse the data, ensuring repeatability and reproducibility.
4. Improve by modifying or redesigning, existing processes and procedures.
5. Control the new process to make sure performance levels are maintained.

Employee Empowerment: According to Heizer and Render (2014:248), employee empowerment refers to the involvement of the employees during all the stages of the production process. Heizer and Render (2014:240), claims that the reason for empowerment is that, "people working on the system on a daily basis understand it better than others. The techniques for building employee empowerment include building communication networks that include employees, developing open, supportive supervisors, building high-morale organisations, and creating formal organisation structures such as teams and quality circles to address a variety of issues".

Benchmarking: According to Heizer and Render (2014:250), "benchmarking involves selecting a demonstrated standard of products, services, costs, or practices that represent the best performance for processes or activities very the similar to your own which the idea is to develop a target at to shoot and then to develop a standard or benchmarking against which to compare your performance".

Total Quality Management in Services: Heizer and Render (2014:261–262) identifies ten attributes of service quality as, "reliability, responsibility, competence, access, courtesy, communication, credibility, security, understanding or knowing the customer, and the tangibles".

2.5 Purpose of the Integrated Quality Management System

According to Education Labour Relations Council Resolution 08 of 2003, the purpose of IQMS is to, "identify specific needs of educators, provide support for continuous growth, promote accountability, monitor an institution's overall performance, and evaluate an educator performance".The process of developing the Personal Growth Plan, selecting the Development Support Groups and the Baseline Assessment has been conducted for all academic staff at the College. Discussions on the outcome of the evaluation has also been discussed with the lecturers concerned. Monitoring has been done in the form of the moderation of the Portfolio of Assessments and the Portfolio of Evidence.The Staff Development Team/s had not been established such that the Skills Development Facilitator is currently relying on the Skills Development Questionnaires for the College Staff Development. The College Improvement Plan addressing outcomes from performance evaluation had not yet been developed.

Personal Growth Plan (PGP): According to the IQMS Training Manual (2003:18), "the Personal Growth Plan is developed by the educator in consultation with members of the Development Support Group". The ELRC Resolution 08 of 2003, clearly indicates that the Personal Growth Plan will then inform the development of the College/Campus Improvement Plan which the Provincial Directorate requires to plan and deploy support staff. **The educator's self-evaluation**
According to the Education Labour Relations Council Resolution 08 of 2003, the educator first conduct self-evaluation with respect to the Integrated Quality Management System in order to be familiar with the instrument and be able to give inputs during observation discussions, and finally measure progress and successes. The educator undertakes evaluation with respect to all seven assessment standards chosen.

The Pre-evaluation Checklist and Discussion: According to ELRC Resolution 08 of 2003, the main aim for the pre-evaluation discussion with the Development Support Group is to check the educator's understanding of the process, expectations, and discussions about the manner in which the performance standards will be rated. **Lesson Observation:** According to the IQMS Training Manual (2003;18), the aim of the lesson plan observation the Development Support Group is to confirm educators' performance in comparison with self-evaluation and the need for capacitation. Consensus is reached in scoring each performance standard evaluated (ELRC Resolution 08 of 2003).

Evaluation of Educators in other Performance Standards: According to the IQMS Training Manual (2003), evaluation with respect to other performance standards is an ongoing observation, discussion and feedback given by the Development Support Group with all relevant documents for evidence and proof participation. According to Resolution 08 of 2003, the observation feedback focus on performance and must be objective and concrete.

The College / Campus Improvement Plan: According to the IQMS Manual (2003:19), the College / Campus Improvement Plan is the list of actions and processes needed for continuous improvement. The purpose of the College Improvement Plan is for College Development Team to continuously monitor and measure progress so that the educational goals are achieved (ELRC, 2003: 19).

2.6 Review of the previous research

Pillay (2010) conducted a research titled; "Educator perception of the implementation of the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS) in Further Education and Training Colleges in South Africa" and came up with the finding that lecturers had not received adequate training on the Integrated Quality Management System. Most of the respondents did not agree that the implementation of the IQMS enhances teaching and learning. The study conducted by Sekgale (2016) on, "investigating teachers' perceptions of the Integrated Quality Management System effectiveness on teaching and learning in rural secondary schools" reveal that teachers were just complying with the policy mandate on implementing the Integrated Quality Management System. Furthermore, the same teachers agreed that were conducting the IQMS for monetary reward only.

III.   RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

According toKelemen and Rumens, (2012: 233) proclaim that "traditionally, quantitative research methodology would be engaged to make generalisation to the organisation in question to engage in a well-established and reliable set of statistical procedures, of which the properties are well-understood". The study conducted therefore adopted the quantitative approach to meet empirical analysis objectives.

3.1 The Research Design

Bryman and Bell (2007:44) explain that the research design refers to the structure for establishing evidence which include sequential objectives emanating from the research questions and the specifics of data sources and limitations. Bhattacherjee, (2012:35) defines research design as a, "blueprint for research intended at answering specific research questions or testing hypotheses and must specify at least the data collection process, the instrument developmental process, population to be studied and sampling process". The study will focus on the latter definition as it is intended to explore the staff's perception of the Integrated Quality Management System then develop guidelines and recommendations for effective implementation of the system at the College.

Descriptive Research: Salkind (2012:10) defines descriptive research as describing the features of the phenomenon that exist. Descriptive research can be independent and serving as the foundation for other types of research using group's characteristics described before meaningful differences are addressed. The proposed research will be conducted in a descriptive design as it is concerned with describing a population with respect to important variable or phenomenon of interest from individual, organisational and industry oriented viewpoint (Sekakan and Bougie 2009: 105).

3.2 The Research Philosophy

Williams (2007:69), claims that, "positivism (quantitative) methodology is based on philosophical approach that effects the natural scientific method to human behaviour research while phenomenological (qualitative) approach share a differing outlook to supporting the natural scientific approach as the norm in human behavioural research"

Positivism (Quantitative) Research Methodology: According to Collins (2010: 38), the positivism principles depends on measurable observations leading to a statistical analysis. Collins (2010:38), further views positivism as, "in accordance with the empiricist view that knowledge stems from human experience". Williams (2007:66) defines positivism as, "the process that involves the collection of data with the intention of quantifying and subjecting information to statistical treatment to reinforce different knowledge claims.

3.3 Research Strategy

Bryman and Bell (2007:28)define research strategy as "a general orientation to conduct a business research which can either embrace a positivist or phenomenological strategy or a combination of the two".

Positivist Research Strategy: "Positivist is an epistemological position that advocates the application of the methods of the natural sciences to the study of social reality and beyond, it also entails

elements of both a deductive approach and an inductive strategy". According to Babbie (2013:21), "the process by which hypotheses are derived follows principles of deductive logic whereby general principles are the foundation of hypotheses and for inductive logic, specific observations are the basis of general principles".

3.4 TargetPopulation

Brynard and Hanekom (2006), defines population as a group of people in an environment sharing similar characteristics. Babbie (2011:173) indicates "target population as the theoretically specified combination of study elements". In this study, the population refers to the lecturers under the employ of the College. The target population for the study is 372 lecturers. The study was conducted on 120 participants comprising of post level 1, 2, 3, and 4 lecturers.

3.5 Sampling Strategy

Terre Blanche,Durrheim and Painter (2009:133) indicate that "sampling is the selection of research participants from an entire population and involves decisions about which people, settings, events, behaviours and social processes to observe". Sekaran and Bougie (2009:196) define sampling as the process by which any subject of the element of the population that is obtained for the purpose of being studied. Brynard and Hannekom (2007:195) define a sampling strategy as "the plan one set forth to be sure that the sample used in the research study represents the population from which one draws the sample". The main groups of sample designs as defined by Terre Blanche *et al.*, (2009:134) are probability sampling and non-probability sampling explained as follows:

Probability Sampling: According to Terre Blanche *et al.* (2009:134) "probability sampling is commonly associated with survey based research where one makes implication from the sample". Babbie (2013:128), probability sampling involves the random selection of rudiments. The more confidence is placed in the representativeness of probability samples. The selection process is done according to the set criteria using simple random, stratified random, cluster, or systematic sampling (Babbie 2011:178).

Non-probability Sampling: According to Babbie (2011:178) "non-probability sampling is a technique in which samples are selected in some way not suggested by probability theory". Babbie (2013:128) further argue that "in non-probability sampling, the researcher has no way of guaranteeing that each element of the population will be presented in the sample". According to Leedy and Ormrod (2010:213) "the major rule is, the greater the sample, the better and same thing applies for a lesser population, for an example, if N = 100 or fewer, there will be minor objective in sampling to survey the whole population". The study used a convenience sampling method of the non-probability sampling to selecting the respondents at the College.

3.6 Data Collection Instrument

The method of collecting data for this empirical research study will be a self-administered questionnaire. The self-administered questionnaire has advantages of being cheaper and quicker to administer, respondents get more time to think about the answers to the questions, it is distributed to a number of people and respondent remain anonymous (Bryman and Bell, 2007:241). According to Babbie (2013:130) the questionnaire collects data by asking the participants questions that lead to agree or disagree responses and include statements representing different viewpoints.

3.7 Data Analysis

Terre Blanche *et al.*, (2009:322) states that data analysis, "is a process of inspecting, cleaning, transforming, and modelling data with the goal of discovering useful information, suggesting conclusions, and supporting decision-making". According to Brynard and Hanekom (2006:60) "once data collection is completed, an in-depth analysis of data must be conducted to test the research objectives". The study to be conducted used the Fisher's exact test in the case of test between two nominal or categorical variables and the Chi-square to analyse the collected data. The data collected was captured into an Excel spreadsheet and then converted into the tests mentioned. The output was then be refined and tabulated using the Excel spreadsheet to produce quality figures and tables to assess the effectiveness of the Integrated Quality Management System at the College.

3.8 Research Validity and Reliability

According to Leedy and Ormrod, (2010: 28), "validity and reliability are two words that one will come across continually in research methodology and these words are often used in connection with measurement, in this context, the validity and reliability of measurement often influence the extent of more

understanding of studied phenomenon, probability of obtaining statistical significance in data analysis and drawing meaningful conclusion from the data".

Validity: Babbie (2011:131) "validity means the extent to which an instrument measures what is claimed to measure – an indicator is valid to the extent that it empirically represents the concept it rationales to measure". Khalid, Hilman and Kumar (2012: 23) define validity as the accuracy of the measuring instrument with the ability of a scale to measure what is intended to measure.

Content Validity: According to Babbie (2011:132), "content validity is the extent to which measurement instrument is concerned with the relevance and representative sample of the content area being measured. The researcher often considers assessment of respondents' achievement within specified field. It is particularly imperative to measure content validity if the study is designed to ascertain respondents' knowledge within a specific field, or to measure personal attributes such as attitudes(Roberts and Priest, 2006:43).

Construct Validity: According to Khalid *et al.*,(2012:24), "construct validity refers to the degree to which a measure or scale uncovers the information which it was designed to uncover".Brynard and Hanekom, (2006:48) state that, "questions for a questionnaire should be specifically designed to obtain the desired information or confirms a network of related hypotheses generated from theory based on the concepts"

Face Validity: According to Ayodele,(2012:392) face validity refers, "to researcher and respondents' subjective evaluations of the presentation and significance of the measuring instrument as to whether the items in the instrument appear to be pertinent, reasonable, unequivocal and clear".

Criterion Validity: Leedy and Ormrod (2010: 92) argues that, "the criterion validity entails the extent to which an instrument selected for data collection, measures what is expected to measure and assessment results could correlate with other results, presumably from the valid known instrument".

3.9 Reliability

Babbie (2011:119) advise that "reliability is a matter of whether a particular technique applied repeatedly to the same object yields the same results each time". Leedy and Ormrod define reliability as the "consistency with which a measuring instrument yields a certain result when the entity being measured hasn't changed

3.10 Limitations of the study

The study was confined to the academic staff of the College. For this empirical study, the findings and the recommendations will be applicable to other Technical and Vocational Education and Training Colleges.

3.11 Elimination of bias

Lind, Marchal and Wathen define bias as "a possible consequence if certain members of the population are denied the opportunity to be selected for a sample". For this empirical study, all academic staff levels were accommodated regardless of age, sex, race, and qualification.

3.12 Pilot Study

Brynard and Hanekom (2006:62) define a pilot study as, "a dress rehearsal of the main research for the reason that it is related to the intentional study, yet on a small scale". Williams (2007:67) list the three values of a pilot study as the way to identify the likely "flaws in measurement procedures and in the operationalisation of independent variables, to identify ambiguous items in a questionnaire", and to create an opportunity for the researcher to examine non-verbal behaviour of the respondents on discomfort experienced on content or wording in a questionnaire. The researcher will first conduct a pilot study with 10 lecturers on management positions categorised as 4 Campus Managers, and 6 Senior Lecturers. Amendments will be made based on the feedback aimed at refining the tool. The amended questionnaire will then be distributed to the target population.

3.13 Ethical Consideration

Leedy and Ormrod (2010: 101), focus on the following most important ethical considerations for the researcher:

Protection from harm: According to Bryman and Bell (2007:133) "respondents should be given an assurance that they will be protected against any physical and emotional harm". The participants were assured of not being subjected to any unnecessary body or psychological harm by given the information required.

Informed consent: The letter of consent wassent with the questionnaire to the participants. According to Babbie (2011:62) "everyone involved in social scientific research needs to be aware of the general agreement shared by the researchers about what is proper or improper in scientific enquiry". The right to participate, not to participate, and/or withdraw from the study was communicated to the intended participants.

Confidentiality and anonymity: According Leedy and Ormrod (2010:101-104) "respondents should be assured of their right of their privacy, for an example, respondents should be assured that their identity will remain anonymous". The rights to privacy with respect to participation to the study was communicated to the respondents.

Permission to conduct the study: The participantswere also furnished with a copy of the letter of permission to conduct the study signed by the Principal of theCollege before attempting the questionnaire. Strict confidentiality to the participants was emphasised.

IV. RESULTS

The data collected by the research instrument for this study was mainly categorical (no Likert scale was used) hence descriptive statistics in the form of frequency distributions (including relative frequencies in the form of percentages) were used. To test any associations between variables nonparametric tests in the form of Fisher's exact tests were used. Fisher's exact test is used in the case of test of association between two nominal or categorical variables. It is a more accurate than test of association and the Chi-square test of independence when the expected frequencies are small.

4.1 Demographic Profile of the Study Sample

The study sample had a fair representation of both males (55.1%) and females (44.9%). Most of the research participants were aged below 46 years with 46.6% being in the 25 to 35 years age group and 41.5% in the 36 to 45 years age group. This indicates that most of the research participants were young adults who might be viewed as a bit radical to processes that demands effort from them. The majority were lecturers (89.8%) with senior lecturers only making up 8.5% of the sample. Campus managers only made up 1.7% of the sample which means that the views of management, who are most likely to support the programme, were under-represented. As far as experience is concerned, most of the participants were not new to their profession as only 4.2% had less 1 year experience. This means that most of the respondents had fair knowledge of how the organisation should function. As far as educational qualifications are concerned there was a fair distribution of respondents on qualifications ranging from Diploma to and Honours degree.

4.2 Implementation and purpose of the Integrated Quality Management System

Only 18.6% of the respondents believe that the IQMS is effectively implemented as compared to 81.4% who believe that it is not. This means that there is still a lot of work to be done with the IQMS as far as its implementation is concerned. There is a general belief that the IQMS serves no positive purpose. Only 16.1% believe that the IQMS serves as a Motivational or retention strategy while only 21.2% believes that it serves for the allocation of incentives. The only purpose which has a higher level of recognition is that the IQMS helps with identification of training and development needs (39.0% believe so), but still the majority do not agree (61.0%). Only 21.2% believe that the purpose of the IQMS helps with the identification of barriers to employee performance while the majority (78.8%) disagree.The results implies that 61.0% of the academic staff at the College do not regard the Integrated Quality Management System as the tool to identify training and development needs. There is still a lot to be done by the organisation to achieve the strategic objectives and goals.

4.3 Management System and Employee Work Profile

In order to test if the perceptions on implementation and purpose of the IQMS are associated with the three worker profile variables, vis., designation, experience and qualification, chi-square tests of association were carried out. Chi-square tests are appropriate in this case since the data collected is categorical. The Fisher's exact test is used in this case since some cells of the contingency tables have expected frequencies less than 5.

4.4 Motivational strategy and Employee Work Profile

Results show that there are no significant differences between the three designations in how they identify motivational strategy as a purpose of the IQMS (Fisher's test statistic=0.345, p-value=1.000) although lecturers have a slightly higher percentage of positive perceptions (17.00% indicated "yes"). The results also show that there are no significant differences between respondents with different levels of

experience in whether they identify motivational strategy as a purpose of the IQMS (Fisher's test statistic=2.616, p-value=0.440). People with different levels of qualifications also do not significantly differ in their perception of motivational strategy as a purpose of the IQMS (Fisher's test statistic=6.780, p-value=0.130). It is noteworthy however, that, those with degrees are more positive about motivational strategy as being a purpose of the IQMS (25.9% said yes)

4.5 Identification of training and development needs and Employee Work Profile

Results show that there is significant association between designation and the identification of training and development needs as a purpose of the IQMS (Fisher's test statistic=14.856, p-value=0.000). Senior lecturers (90.0%) and campus managers (100%) seem to have more appreciation of the usefulness of the IQMS as a tool for the identification of training and development needs. Lecturers lag behind in this regard as only 33.0% said yes.The results also show that experience is a significant factor in the identification of the IQMS as a tool for the identification of training and development needs (Fisher's test statistic=9.222, p-value=0.022). It appears that those with more than 7 years of experience have a more positive attitude towards IQMS as a means of identifying training and development needs (55.3%). Those with less than 1 year experience also have a more positive attitude towards IQMS as a means of identifying training and development needs (40.0%). People with different levels of qualifications not significantly differ in their perception of the IQMS as a means of identifying training and development needs (Fisher's test statistic=1.543, p-value=0.833).As far as the relevance of human judgment in the Performance Management System is concerned, a slight majority agreed (54.2). This leaves out 45.8% who still do not believe in the relevance of human judgment in the Performance Management System.Association between perceptions on low throughput and certification rates and employee work profile: Results of tests of association show that there are no significant differences in the view that low throughput and certification rates are the results of poorly managed Integrated Quality Management at the College between people of different designations. However, qualification significantly influences people's views on the effects of poor management of the Integrated Quality Management System at the College on low throughput and certification rates Those with Diplomas seem to feel strongly that poor management is to blame for low throughput and certification rates (74.2% said yes) while those with Honours degrees seem to agree less (only 35.3% said yes). The other educational levels are in between these two extremes.

4.6 Barriers to compliance - current Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS)

The barriers are in the form of processes that form part of the performance management system, how individuals, teams and organisational objectives are linked to performance, determinants of job performance in the organisation and psychological barriers to effective performance appraisal.

Summary of Barriers to Compliance with the IQMS: Results show that very few respondents indicated that the following processes formed part of their performance management system: Coaching and Mentoring (21.2%), Training and Development (56.8%) and Career Pathing and Succession Planning (25.4%). The exception being Training and Development. The results imply that 43.2% of the academic staff still need to undergo training on the Integrated Quality Management System. As far as the link between individual, team and organisational objectives and performance is concerned, only 27.1% indicated that it was by the Cascading of goals by supervisors, 22.0% indicated that it was by comparing employee performance to organisational objectives and 51.7% indicated that it was by enabling employees to see how their job contributes to the overall objectives of the organisation through frequent interactions. It is therefore imperative that there is lack of understanding of the important links between individual, team and organisational objectives and performance. Very small percentages of the respondents seem to agree to the following as determinants of job performance: Attitude (34.7%), Aptitude (8.5%), Organisational culture (35.6%) and Technology competency (32.2%). The statement might have confused the respondents. Results of tests of association presented show that there are no significant differences, in whether Organisational Culture is viewed as a determinant of job performance in the organisation, between respondents of different designations (Fisher's test statistic=0697, p-value=0.880). However, there are significant differences between different levels of experience (Fisher's test statistic=13.322, p-value=0.003). About 50.0% of those with between 5 to 7 years of experience identified believe Organisational Culture is a determinant of job performance in the organisation and 46.8% of those with more than 7 years of experience believe the same. Fewer of those with less than 5 years of experience believe that Organisational Culture is a determinant of job performance in the organisation (0% for less than 1 year experience and 17.5% for 2 to 4 years of experience). Different qualifications also differ in their perception of Organisational Culture is a determinant of job performance in the organisation (Fisher's test statistic=13.450, p-value=0.0.008). There seems to be an increasing trend, with increasing level of education, in the belief in Organisational Culture as a determinant of job performance in the organisation.

Feeling of insecurity as a psychological barrier: The results show that the view that the Feeling of insecurity constitutes a psychological barrier to effective performance appraisal does not significantly differ between people of different; In all cases the majority of the people in the various biographical categories do not believe that the feeling of insecurity constitutes a psychological barrier to effective performance appraisal (percentages indicating "Yes" are all less than 50%).

Cause Resentment to Subordinates: The results show that the feeling that performance appraisal might cause resentment to subordinates constitutes a psychological barrier to effective performance appraisal, significantly differ between people of different designations (The most junior designation (lecturers) are not too concerned about performance appraisal causing resentment to subordinates (only 34.9% agreed) but the senior lecturers are more concerned (70.0% agreed). The two campus managers involved in the study also agreed. Resentment by subordinates as a psychological barrier is not significantly associated with experience () and qualifications. Results show that most of the respondents do not really appreciate the importance of the IQMS as a tool for executing organisational strategies. Only 16.1% believe that the performance management system serves as a motivational or retention strategy. Only 21.2% believe that it serves as an allocation of incentives strategy, while only 39.0% believe that it serves for the identification of training and development needs. Only 21.2% believe that it serves to identify barriers to employee performance. There is therefore need to educate the population about the strategic goals of the performance management system.As far as the determinants of the success of the performance management system are concerned, 33.1% believe that it is important to choose the right method of appraisal while 57.6% believe that individual goals should be aligned to the organisation's goals. This seems to suggest that input from individuals should be used to fine tune the performance management system.Very few respondents believe that performance management involves evaluation (24.6%) and filling forms (22.9%). However a sizeable majority believe that performance management should involve Identification of training needs and development (56.8%). A surprising result is that, despite some misgivings in the understanding of the IQMS, the majority still believe that the IQMS process is administered objectively in the institution (66.1%). Coming to the possible causes of failure of performance appraisal in the organisation, very few see lack of clarity coming into play (28.8%) while very few have reservation about the interval of appraisal (30.5%). There a bit of a worry with the lack of communication by supervisors (39.8%).

Lack of communication by supervisors: The results show that the views on Lack of communication by supervisors as a cause of failure of performance appraisaldo not significantly differ between people of different; designations (Fisher's test statistic=4.400, p-value=0.084) and qualifications (Fisher's test statistic=1.783, p-value=0.788) but significantly differ by experience (Fisher's test statistic=10.929, p-value=0.009). The results reveal that even the management staff needs capacitation on the Integrated Quality Management System. This implies that the implementation of the IQMS is not implemented effectively at the College.

V.   FINDINGS

Objective One: Determine the effectiveness of the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS) at the College.

Fieldwork: The empirical analysis showed that the highest percentage of staff members, 81.4% believed that the Integrated Quality Management System is not effectively implemented at the College and there are no significant differences between the Lecturers, Senior Lecturers and Campus Managers in their negative opinion towards the IQMS although Senior Lecturers is slightly higher by 30.0%. The results also show no significant differences in perceptions on IQMS implementation between respondents of different levels of experience   The results also show that experience is a significant factor in the identification of IQMS as a tool for identification of training and development needs The results reflect that those with more than 7 years of experience have a more positive attitude towards IQMS as a means of identifying training and development needs (55.3%). 61.0% of the respondents agree that low throughput and certification rates are the results of poorly managed Integrated Quality Management System at the College. The respondents with Diploma qualification, 74.2%, also agree that poor management of the IQMS has to blame for low throughput and certification rate while those with Honours degrees seem to agree less.

Conclusion: The above empirical analysis reveals that the respondents perceive the Integrated Quality Management System as not being effectively implemented at the College.

Recommendation: It is recommended that the IQMS be implemented effectively for the College to achieve its goals through improved throughput and the certification rate. The effective implementation of the IQMS will help identify lecturer needs and provide support for continuous growth.

Objective Two: Establish the extent to which the academic staff comply with the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS).

Fieldwork: The empirical analysis reveal that compliance to the Integrated Quality Management System by academic staff is low. It is a huge concern that only 39.8% of the respondents indicated having a Personal Growth Plan, 38.1% indicated that they have a Development Support Group, and 70.3% of the respondents indicated being unhappy about the Integrated Quality Management System at the College. The results of test of association show that there are no significant differences in either having or not having a Personal Growth Plan between academics of different designations. The results reveal that there are no significant differences in either having or not having a Development Support Group between academics of different designations

Conclusion: The empirical analysis reveals that compliance with the Integrated Quality Management System at the College is currently a paper exercise for submission.

Recommendation: It recommended that the staff be intensively trained on the Integrated Quality Management System, the induction of the newly appointed staff must include performance management.

Objective Three: Uncover the barriers with the current Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS).

Fieldwork: The barriers are in the form of processes that form part of a performance management system, how individuals, teams and organisational objectives are linked to performance, determinants of job performance in the organisation and psychological barriers to effective performance appraisal. The findings have shown that Coaching and Mentoring (21.2%) that there are no significant differences, in whether it forms part of the performance management system or not, between respondents of different Training and Development as a component of the performance management system and employee work profile (56.8%), show that there are no significant differences which forms part of performance management system or not, between respondents of different designations and qualification Results have shown that there is a tests of association between Career Pathing and Succession Planning as a component of the performance management system and employee work profile. There are no significant differences, in whether Career Pathing and Succession Planning forms part of the performance management system or not, between respondents of different designations and qualification.

Conclusion: The analysis conducted reveals that the day-to-day operations are not aligned to the organisation's objectives and goals which creates challenges in the administration of performance management at the College.

Recommendation: It is recommended that employee's day-to-day activities be aligned to the organisation's objectives and staff development programmes must be informed by the output from performance evaluation to address barriers that hinder curriculum delivery in order to improve the quality of teaching and learning.

Objective Four: Strategies for improving staffs' experience of the Integrated Quality Management System.

Fieldwork: The empirical analysis established that the respondents believe are the key strategic objectives of the IQMS, how such strategies can succeed, what the execution of such strategies involve and possible barriers to the success of such strategies. Motivational strategy do not significantly differ between people of different, designations experience and qualifications Retention strategy do not significantly differ between people of different, designations experience and qualifications. Allocation of Incentives strategy do not significantly differ between people of different, designations experience and qualifications Identification of training and development needs strategy significantly between people of different designations As the ranks in designation rise, there is significant factor affecting the views on identification of training and development needs as a key strategy concern The more experienced members of staff (7+years) are more emphatic in their endorsement of this issue as a key strategic concern (55.3% said yes). Qualification is not a significant factor affecting the views on identification of training and development needs as a key strategy concern The results shows that identification of barriers to employee performance do not significantly differ between people of different designations experience and qualifications

Conclusion: The above mentioned results have shown that the motivational strategy and retention strategy have the same frequency and percentage, which means that both strategies are the priority in order to get good production.

Recommendation: It is recommended that the college should concentrate on the identification of training and development needs with the 39.0%, in order to improve the quality of teaching.

VI.   CONCLUSION

The recommendation made under each objective were made based on the findings from the literature review and the primary research. The evidence of the empirical analysis reveal that the Integrated Quality Management System is not effectively implemented at the College. The College is currently unable to effectively identify the needs of educators and provide ongoing support and monitor the performance for improved results. It is recommended that the College implement the recommendations and monitor progress.

REFERENCES

[1].   Human Resource Development Council of South Africa, 2014. Synthesis report of the TVET colleges technical task team strengthening and supporting TVET colleges for expanded access and increased programme quality, HRDCSA

[2].   DHET (2012). Green Paper for Post School Education and Training. Pretoria: Department of Higher Education and Training.

[3].   Education Labour Relations Council, (2003). Evaluation Procedures, Processes and Performance Standards for Institution based educators. Resolution 1 of 2003.

[4].   Education Labour Relations Council, (2003). Integrated Quality Management System. Resolution 8 of 2008.Government Gazette (Volume 433, No. 22512

[5].   McGrath, S., and Lugg, R., 2012. Knowing and doing vocational education and training reform: Evidence, learning and the policy process. International Journal of Educational Development 32 (5), 696–708

[6].   South African Government Information. 2012. National Development Plan 2030 Our Future-make it work, [Online] Available: http://www.poa.gov.za/news/Documents/NPC%20National%20Development%20Plan%20Vision%202030%20-lo-res.pdf, Accessed: 4 May 2015

[7].   DHET (2014). White Paper for post-school education and training: building an expanded, effective and integrated post-school system. Pretoria: DHET

[8].   Pillay, P. (2010). Educator perception of the implementation of Integrated Quality Management Systems (IQMS) in Further Education and Training Colleges in South Africa. MED Dissertation. North-West University.

[9].   Sekgale N. Z. (2016) Investigating Teachers' perceptions of Quality Management System effectiveness on teaching and learning in rural secondary school: MED Dissertation: University of South Africa.

[10].   Noe, R.A., Hollenbeck, J.R., Gerthart, B. and Wright, P.M. (2012) Human Resource Management: Gaining a Competitive Advantage. 8th Edition. McGraw-Hill

[11].   Grobler, P., Wärnich, S., Carrell, M.R., Elbert, N.F. and Hatfield, R.D. (2006). Human Resource Management in South Africa. 3rd Ed. London: Thomson.

[12].   Kleynhans, R., Markham, L., Meyer, W., Van Aswegen, S. and Pilbeam, E. (2007). Human Resource Management: Fresh Perspectives.New Jersey: Prentice Hall

[13].   Heizer, J. and Render, B. (2014). Operations Management, Eleventh Edition, Upper Saddle River, NJ:Prentice Hall.

[14].   Snell, S. and Bohlander, G. (2007). Human Resource Management. Mason: Thompson

[15].   Nel, P.S., Werner, A., Haasbroek, G.D., Poisat, P., Sono, T and Schultz, H.B. (2011). Human Resource Management. 8th Edition, Cape Town: Oxford University Press South Africa.

[16].   Brown, D.R. (2011).An Experimental Approach to Organizational Development. 8th Edition. Prentice Hall.

[17].   Schroeder, R.G. (2008). Six Sigma: Definition and Underlying Theory. Journal of Operations Management 26, No, 4: 536 – 554.

[18].   Sekgale N. Z. (2016) Investigating Teachers' perceptions of Quality Management System effectiveness on teaching and learning in rural secondary school: MED Dissertation: University of South Africa.

[19].   Kelemen, M., and Rumens, N. (2012) Pragmatism and heterodoxy in organization research: Going beyond the quantitative/qualitative divide, International Journal of Organizational Analysis, Vol. 20 Iss: 1, pp.5 - 12

[20].   Bryman, A. and Bell, E. (2007). Business Research Methods. 2nd Edition. Oxford University Press.

[21].   Bhattacherjee, A. (2012). Social Science Research: Principles, Methods, and Practices.2nd edition. USF Tampa Bay Open Access Textbooks Collection. Book 3. [Online] http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/oa_textbooks/3 [Accessed 3 May 2015].

[22].   Salkind, N.J. (2012). Exploring Research, New Jersey, Pearson Education, Inc.

[23].   Sekaran, U. and Bougie, R. (2009). Research Methods for Business. 5th Edition. John Wiley & Sons Limited.

[24].   Williams, C. (2007). Research Methods. Journal of Business and Economic Research, Vol. 5 (3), p. 65 – 72.

[25].   Collins, H. 2010. Creative research: the theory and practice of research for the creative industries. Lausanne: AVA Publishing SA.

[26].   Babbie, E. (2013).The Practise of Social Research. 13th edition,International Edition. Canada. Wadsworth CENGAGE learning.

[27].   Brynard, P.A. and Hanekom, S.X. (2006). Introduction to research in management related fields. 2nd Edition. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

[28].   Babbie, E. (2011). Introduction to Social Research. 5th Edition, International Edition. Canada. Wadsworth CENGAGE learning.

[29].   Terre Blanche, M., Durrheim, K. and Painter, D. (eds.) (2009). Research in Practise: Applied methods for the social sciences. Second Edition. South Africa. University of Cape Town Press (Pty) Ltd and Moonstats CD.

[30].   Leedy, P.D., and Ormrod, J.E. (2010). Practical Research. 9th Edition, New Jersey: Pearson Education, Inc.

[31].   Khalid, K., Hilman, H. and Kumar, D. (2012). Get along with quantitative research process.InternationalJournal of Research in Management, 2(2), p. 15-29.

[32].   Roberts, P. and Priest, H. (2006). Reliability and validity in research. Nursing Standard, 20 (44), p. 41-45.

[33].   Ayodele, O.J. (2012). Validity and Reliability Issues in Educational Research. Journal of Educational and Social Research, Lind, D.A., Marchal, W.G. and Wathen, S.A. (2008). Statistical Techniques in Business and Economics. 13th Edition.New York:McGraw Hill Irwin.